

Econ 5470
Spring 2006

Evaluation of Rough Drafts:

Pair up with someone from your research topic group and exchange papers. As you read the other student's paper, fill out this form concerning the paper's thesis, argument, strengths, and weaknesses. Focus on how well the author communicates his/her argument (don't worry about correcting grammar and spelling errors). Be constructive. Return the completed form and rough draft to the author when you are done.

Be sure to give me a copy of your rough draft. I will read them all and return them to you with comments on Tuesday, 4/11. If you want to meet with me to discuss your draft, please talk to me immediately to make arrangements.

PAPER AUTHORS SHOULD REFER TO THESE EVALUATIONS AS THEY REVISE THEIR PAPERS. WHEN YOU TURN IN YOUR FINAL DRAFT ON APRIL 18, YOU SHOULD ALSO TURN IN THIS EVALUATION FORM, ALONG WITH A PARAGRAPH DESCRIBING HOW YOU HAVE REVISED YOUR PAPER IN RESPONSE TO THIS PEER REVIEW AND IN RESPONSE TO MY READING OF YOUR ROUGH DRAFT.

Author's Name:

Paper Title:

Reviewer's Name:

Thesis of the paper: Try to state the paper's thesis in a sentence or two. You should be able to do this after reading the first few paragraphs. For example, the following could be a thesis statement for Keyssar's research on unemployment in Massachusetts: "Unemployment became a recognized social problem in Massachusetts in the late 1800s because self-employment, subsistence agriculture, home production, the holding of multiple jobs, and personal ties with employers became more rare as the economy industrialized."

Write the paper's thesis here:

Outline of the argument: Write a simple outline of the author's argument in support of their thesis. You might do this by writing a sentence summarizing each paragraph.

Indicate the paper's strengths: What were the most effective, clear, persuasive, or interesting elements of the paper?

Indicate the paper's weaknesses: No first draft (or final draft) is perfect. What parts of the paper need the most attention or re-writing? What was confusing?